APPRAISAL REPORT

3.822 Net Acres
Southwest Corner of Liberty Way and Cox Road
West Chester Township, Butler County, Ohio 45069

PREPARED FOR:

David L. Spinney
Director
Butler County TID
1921 Fairgrove Avenue
Hamilton, Ohio 45011

PREPARED BY:

Beck Consulting, Inc.
Town Hall on the Green—4B
5380 Pleasant Avenue
Fairfield, Ohio 45014
513.942.5000
FAX 513.942.9602

EFFECTIVE DATE OF VALUE:

As Is Market Value of the Fee Simple Estate as of June 20, 2014
July 15, 2014

David L. Spinney
Director
Butler County TID
1921 Fairgrove Avenue
Hamilton, Ohio 45011

RE: APPRAISAL REPORT
3.822 Net Acres
Southwest Corner of Liberty Way and Cox Road
West Chester Township, Butler County, Ohio 45069

Dear Mr. Spinney:

Based on your authorization, we have completed an appraisal of the 3.822-net-acre site currently owned by the Butler County Transportation Improvement District located at the southwest corner of Liberty Way and Cox Road within West Chester Township, Butler County, Ohio.

A personal visit to this property was performed on June 20, 2014. The analyses used to form an opinion of value are contained in the following appraisal report. The intended use of this report is to assist the Butler County Transportation Improvement District in determining a market value of the property for negotiation and disposition. The following document is an appraisal report prepared in conformity with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP), and the Code of Professional Ethics of the Appraisal Institute. The attached report is a detailed presentation of the research, data, and analysis, which concludes that the market value of the fee simple interest of the subject property is:

One Million Six Hundred Sixty Thousand Dollars
($1,660,000)

The reported value conclusion is subject to the assumptions and limiting conditions set forth in the body of this report. This letter is not the appraisal, but is followed by an appraisal report setting forth the identification of the property, pertinent facts about the neighborhood and the subject property, comparable market data, and the results of the investigations and analyses leading to the final value conclusion.

Respectfully submitted,

BECK CONSULTING, INC.

Lance R. Brown, MAI
Ohio General Certified Appraiser No. 000409301

Todd M. Schmutte
Ohio General Certified Appraiser No. 2007005172
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**TITLE PAGE**

**LETTER OF TRANSMITTAL**

**PART I. INTRODUCTION**
- SUBJECT PHOTOGRAPHS ................................................................. 4
- CERTIFICATION .................................................................................. 7
- SUMMARY OF IMPORTANT FACTS AND CONCLUSIONS .............................. 8

**PART II. PREMISES OF THE APPRAISAL**
- PURPOSE AND INTENDED USE OF THE APPRAISAL ................................. 9
- INTENDED USE ............................................................................... 9
- CLIENT AND INTENDED USERS .......................................................... 9
- INDICATED EXPOSURE TIME ............................................................... 9
- DEFINITION OF VALUE AND PROPERTY RIGHTS APPRAISED .............. 9
- SCOPE OF WORK ............................................................................ 10
- ASSUMPTIONS AND LIMITING CONDITIONS ......................................... 11

**PART III. PRESENTATION OF DATA**
- IDENTIFICATION OF THE REAL ESTATE ............................................. 13
- HISTORY OF PROPERTY BEING APPRAISED ................................. 13
- NEIGHBORHOOD DESCRIPTION AND ANALYSIS .............................. 14
- REAL ESTATE TAX DATA ................................................................. 22
- SITE DATA .................................................................................. 23

**PART IV. ANALYSIS OF DATA AND CONCLUSIONS**
- HIGHEST AND BEST USE ................................................................ 25
- SALES COMPARISON APPROACH ..................................................... 28
- RECONCILIATION OF FINAL VALUE ................................................. 46
- FINAL VALUE ................................................................................ 46
- MARKETING/EXPOSURE TIME .......................................................... 47

**PART V. ADDENDA**
- APPRAISER QUALIFICATIONS ............................................................. 50
- APPRAISER DISCLOSURE STATEMENTS .............................................. 53
PART I. INTRODUCTION

SUBJECT PHOTOGRAPHS

Aerial view of subject taken from the Butler County GIS

Aerial view of subject taken from Bing Maps on June 18, 2014 – facing west
3.822 Net Acres of Vacant Land
Southwest Corner of Liberty Way and Cox Road
West Chester Township, Butler County, Ohio 45069
3.822 Net Acres of Vacant Land
Southwest Corner of Liberty Way and Cox Road
West Chester Township, Butler County, Ohio 45069

Subject – from southeast

Subject – from northwest

Subject property – facing south

Western property line – from north

Subject property – facing southeast

Liberty Way – facing east
CERTIFICATION

We certify that, to the best of our knowledge and belief:

- The statements of fact contained in this report are true and correct.

- The reported analyses, opinions, and conclusions are limited only by the reported assumptions and limiting conditions, and is our personal, impartial, and unbiased professional analyses, opinions, and conclusions.

- We have no present or prospective interest in the property that is the subject of this report and no personal interest with respect to the parties involved.

- We have no bias with respect to the property that is the subject of this report or to the parties involved with this assignment.

- Our engagement in this assignment was not contingent upon developing or reporting predetermined results.

- Our compensation for completing this assignment is not contingent upon the development or reporting of a predetermined value or direction in value that favors the cause of the client, the amount of the value opinion, the attainment of a stipulated result, or the occurrence of a subsequent event directly related to the intended use of this appraisal.

- This appraisal has been made in conformity with and is subject to the requirements of the Code of Professional Ethics and Standards of Professional Conduct of the Appraisal Institute.

- The use of this report is subject to the requirements of the Appraisal Institute relating to review by its duly authorized representatives.

- As of the date of this report, Lance Brown, MAI has completed the requirements of the continuing education program of the Appraisal Institute.

- Todd Schmutte and Lance Brown, MAI have made a property visit of the subject of this report.

- As of the date of this report, Lance Brown, MAI and Todd Schmutte have completed the requirements of the continuing education program of the State of Ohio.

- Todd Schmutte and Lance Brown, MAI are general appraisers certified by the State of Ohio.

- We have performed no services, as an appraiser or in any other capacity, regarding the property that is the subject of the report within the three-year period immediately preceding the acceptance of this assignment.

As Is Market Value as of April 16, 2013 is: One Million Six Hundred Sixty Thousand Dollars ($1,660,000)

Lance R. Brown, MAI
Ohio General Certified Appraiser No. 000409301

Todd M. Schmutte
Ohio General Certified Appraiser No. 2007005172
SUMMARY OF IMPORTANT FACTS AND CONCLUSIONS

Property Appraised: The property being appraised is located at the southwest corner of Liberty Way and Cox Road in West Chester Township, Butler County, Ohio 45069. The subject property is vacant land owned by the Butler County TID.

Description of Property:

Site: The subject site is an irregular-shaped parcel containing 4.2890 acres of gross land, with 0.4670 acres located within the right-of-way of Liberty Way, leaving a net land area of 3.8220 acres. The majority of the subject property is zoned A-1, Agricultural, while the western portion is zoned M-1, Light Industrial. The topography of the subject property is level to gently rolling. The subject property is not located within a flood zone.

Objective of the Appraisal:

Purpose: The purpose of this appraisal is to estimate the fee simple market value of the subject property.

Intended Use: The intended use of this appraisal to establish a market value for potential negotiation and disposition.

Intended User: The intended users of this report is the client, the Butler County Transportation Improvement District.

Highest and Best Use:

As If Vacant: The highest and best use of the subject site as if vacant is for commercial development.

Market Value and Conclusions:

Land As If Vacant: As Is Market Value of the Fee Simple Estate as of June 20, 2014 is: $1,660,000

Valuation Date: June 20, 2014

Report Date: July 15, 2014

Marketing Time: 9 to 12 Months

Exposure Time: 9 to 12 Months
PART II. PREMISES OF THE APPRAISAL

PURPOSE AND INTENDED USE OF THE APPRAISAL

The purpose of this appraisal is to estimate the “as is” value of the fee simple estate of the real estate as of June 20, 2014, subject to the assumptions and limiting conditions presented in this report.

Todd Schmutte and Lance R. Brown, MAI made a personal property visit to the subject site on June 20, 2014. The subject photos were taken on June 20, 2014.

INTENDED USE

The intended use of this appraisal is to be used by the client to establish the fair market value of the subject property for negotiation and possible disposition.

CLIENT AND INTENDED USERS

Client: Butler County Transportation Improvement District. The intended users include the client. The intended users of this report are authorized to rely on the report and its conclusions.

INDICATED EXPOSURE TIME

Exposure time for the subject property, assuming market value, is estimated to be 12 months or less.

DEFINITION OF VALUE AND PROPERTY RIGHTS APPRAISED

Market Value\(^1\) means the most probable price that a property should bring in a competitive and open market under all conditions requisite to a fair sale, the buyer and seller each acting prudently and knowledgeably, and assuming the price is not affected by undue stimulus. Implicit in this definition are the consummation of a sale as of a specified date and the passing of title from seller to buyer under conditions whereby:

1. buyer and seller are typically motivated;
2. both parties are well informed or well advised, and acting in what they consider their own best interest;
3. a reasonable time is allowed for exposure in the open market;
4. payment is made in terms of cash in U.S. dollars or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto; and
5. the price represents the normal consideration for the property sold unaffected by special or creative financing or sales concessions granted by anyone associated with the sale.

\(^1\) (Source: Office of the Comptroller of the Currency under 12 CFR, Subpart C-Appraisals, 34.42 Definitions [f].)
According to the Appraisal Institute’s, *The Dictionary of Real Estate Appraisal*, 5th ed. (Chicago: Appraisal Institute), 2010, the following pertinent terms referenced in the report are defined as follows:

**As Is Market Value**: The estimate of the market value of real property in its current physical condition, use, and zoning as of the appraisal date.

**Fee Simple Estate**: Absolute ownership unencumbered by any other interest or estate, subject only to the limitations imposed by the governmental powers of taxation, eminent domain, police power, and escheat.

**SCOPE OF WORK**

The first step in the appraisal process is to identify the subject property and conduct a series of investigations concerning the market within which the property is located. Included is an analysis of the subject property and the demographic trends and market demand.

A number of independent sources were referenced to analyze the subject’s market area. Greater Cincinnati regional, West Chester Township neighborhood, and demographic data were obtained from the Greater Cincinnati Chamber of Commerce, Butler County Chamber of Commerce, United States Census Bureau, and information generally available from other secondary sources. The trend in real estate value was concluded based on analysis of market data and discussions with owners, buyers, developers, and agents active in the market area.

The site data was prepared subsequent to a physical visit to the site. A property survey was provided by the client. Information provided by West Chester Township, the Butler County Engineer, the Butler County Auditor, and the Butler County Recorder’s Office have been considered and incorporated into this appraisal. In addition, the most recent Federal Emergency Management Agency floodplain maps have been reviewed and incorporated into the report.

The highest and best use of the subject property was concluded based on analysis of the site and in consideration of the legally permissible, physically possible, and economically feasible uses of the property. The highest and best use was concluded to be commercial development.

Sales were identified that shared the same or similar highest and best use to the subject property. To identify these sales, preliminary market data was obtained from companies that compile and publish public information. This preliminary data was analyzed and confirmed with individuals directly involved in, or close to, the transaction such as the buyer, seller, agent, or their representative. The quality of the data was good, increasing the reliability of the conclusions.

Neither the cost nor income approaches were applied in this appraisal, since these are not the typical methods used to estimate the market value of vacant land.

The sales comparison approach was applied to the subject, and adjustments were considered for differences between the sales and the subject. The final value conclusion is based on the sales comparison approach.
ASSUMPTIONS AND LIMITING CONDITIONS

General Underlying Assumptions and Limiting Conditions:

1. The report is considered valid only for whom it was prepared and for the stated purpose and function.
2. That the term market value, as herein used, is defined preceding this appraisal report.
3. That the date of value to which the opinions expressed in this report apply is set forth in the letter of transmittal. The appraiser assumes no responsibility for economic or physical factors occurring at some later date that may affect the opinions herein stated.
4. That no opinion is intended to be expressed for legal matters or that would require specialized investigator knowledge beyond that ordinarily employed by real estate appraisers, although such matters may be discussed in the report.
5. That no opinion as to title is rendered. Data on ownership and the legal description were obtained from sources generally considered reliable. Title is assumed to be marketable and free and clear of all liens and encumbrances, easements, and restrictions except those specifically discussed in the report. The property is appraised assuming it to be under responsible ownership and competent management and available for its highest and best use.
6. That no engineering survey has been made by the appraiser. Except as specifically stated, data relative to size and area were taken from sources considered reliable, and no encroachment of real property improvements is assumed to exist.
7. That maps, plats, and exhibits included herein are for illustration only, as an aid in visualizing matters discussed within the report. They should not be considered as surveys or relied upon for any other purpose.
8. That no opinion is expressed as to the value of subsurface oil, gas, or mineral rights, and that the property is not subject to surface entry for the exploration or removal of such materials except as is expressly stated.
9. That the projections included in this report are utilized to assist in the valuation process and are based on current market conditions, anticipated short term supply and demand factors, and a continued stable economy. Therefore, the projections are subject to changes in future conditions that cannot be accurately predicted by the appraiser and could affect the future income or value projections.
10. That testimony or attendance in court or at any other hearing is not required by reason of rendering this appraisal unless such arrangements are made a reasonable time in advance.
11. Information contained in this report is assumed to be correct but is not guaranteed.
12. Possession of this report or any copy thereof does not carry with it the right of publication. Neither all nor any part of the contents of this Report (especially any conclusions as to value, the identity of the Appraiser or the firm with which the appraiser is connected shall be disseminated to the public through advertising media, public relations media, news media, sales media or any other public means of communication, without the prior written consent and approval of the author.
13. That, because no title report was made available to the appraiser, he assumed no responsibility for such items of record not disclosed by his normal investigation.
14. That no detailed soil studies covering the subject property were available to the appraiser. Therefore, premises as to soil qualities employed in this report are not conclusive but have been considered consistent with information available to the appraiser.

15. That the appraiser has personally inspected the subject property and finds no obvious evidence of structural deficiencies except as stated in this report; however, no responsibility for hidden defects or conformity to specific governmental requirements, such as fire, building and safety, earthquake, or occupancy codes, can be assumed without provision of specific professional or governmental inspections.

16. That no consideration has been given in this appraisal to personal property located on the premises, or to the cost of moving or relocating such personal property; only the real property has been considered.

17. That the appraiser is not qualified to detect the existence of potentially hazardous material which may or may not be present on or near the property, such as the presence of formaldehyde foam insulation, existence of toxic waste, or the existence of asbestos insulation. The existence of such substances may have an affect on the value of the property. No consideration has been given in our analysis to any potential diminution in value should such hazardous materials be found. We urge the client to retain an expert in the field before making a business decision regarding the property.

18. It is assumed any requirements under the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) for the subject property have been met. In the event any requirements are currently pending that would require modification to the existing structure, the appraiser reserves the right to amend this report and make any value adjustment considered necessary.
PART III. PRESENTATION OF DATA

IDENTIFICATION OF THE REAL ESTATE

Location: The subject property is located at southwest corner of Liberty Way and Cox Road in West Chester Township, Butler County, Ohio 45069.

Ownership: Butler County Transportation Improvement District

Butler County Auditor’s Parcel ID Nos: M5610-015.000-022, M5610-020.000-001 & -147

HISTORY OF PROPERTY BEING APPRAISED

The subject was acquired in three separate transfers from three different parties over five years ago. Parcel M5610-015.000-022 was transferred to the Butler County Transportation Improvement District on May 11, 2006 from MetroParks of Butler County. Parcel M5610-020.000-015 was transferred from Mark Sennet on March 22, 2007. Parcel M5610-020.000-147 was transferred from Tylers Place Associates, LLC on May 6, 2009.
NEIGHBORHOOD DESCRIPTION AND ANALYSIS

Neighborhood Location Map
The subject of this appraisal is in West Chester Township, an unincorporated area of Butler County located approximately 20 miles north of Cincinnati’s downtown business district and 30 miles south of Dayton, Ohio. The subject is located at the southwest corner of Liberty Way and Cox Road, at the northern border of West Chester Township.

West Chester has experienced significant growth due to the development of the Interstate System, primarily I-75. When Interstate 75 was constructed in the 1950s, approximately 7 miles were located in the middle of West Chester, bisecting the community. During the initial construction, two interchanges were built within West Chester, at Tylersville Road and Cincinnati-Dayton Road. With the construction of Interstate 275, Cincinnati’s outer beltway in the 1970s, an additional five interstate interchanges were within one mile of the township's limits.

The Township of West Chester is in the southeast corner of Butler County, Ohio bounded to the south side by Hamilton County and to the east by Warren County. To the west is Fairfield Township and the City of Fairfield and to the north is Liberty Township.

The township consists of 22,080 acres, with 72.5% (or 16,008 acres) zoned residential, 23.0% (or 5,078 acres) zoned industrial, and 4.5% (or 994 acres) zoned commercial. Currently, there are approximately 3,500 acres available for residential development, 3,000 acres available for industrial development and 250 acres available for commercial development.

Generally, there are four forces that influence the value of property. They are social, economic, governmental, and environmental.

**Social Factors**

A primary social factor of a market area is its population. The population trend in this region consists of a movement from the inner city areas of Hamilton County and Cincinnati out to the surrounding suburbs. Areas of West Chester Township have been one of those suburban areas that have attracted residents into its boundaries over the past two decades. West Chester Township’s population within a one three and five mile radius of the subject has been and is projected to remain stable or slightly increasing between the 2000 and 2010 census and beyond to 2018.

Summarized in the following grids are the demographics within a 1-, 3-, and 5-mile radius of the subject property:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1-Mile Radius</th>
<th>3-Mile Radius</th>
<th>5-Mile Radius</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2000 Population</td>
<td>1,106</td>
<td>42,918</td>
<td>97,347</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010 Population</td>
<td>2,414</td>
<td>54,503</td>
<td>123,792</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013 Population</td>
<td>2,462</td>
<td>55,729</td>
<td>126,660</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018 Population</td>
<td>2,544</td>
<td>57,777</td>
<td>131,458</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000 – 2010 Annual Rate</td>
<td>8.11%</td>
<td>2.42%</td>
<td>2.43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010 – 2013 Annual Rate</td>
<td>0.60%</td>
<td>0.69%</td>
<td>0.71%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013 – 2018 Annual Rate</td>
<td>0.66%</td>
<td>0.72%</td>
<td>0.75%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In the identified area, the current year population is 126,660. In 2010, the Census count in the area was 123,792. The rate of change since 2010 was 0.71% annually. The five-year projection for the population in the area is 131,458 representing a change of 0.75% annually from 2013 to 2018. Currently, the population is 49.3% male and 50.7% female. The median age in this area is 37.8, compared to U.S. median age of 37.3.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Households</th>
<th>1-Mile Radius</th>
<th>3-Mile Radius</th>
<th>5-Mile Radius</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2000 Households</td>
<td>379</td>
<td>14,360</td>
<td>32,605</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010 Households</td>
<td>886</td>
<td>18,446</td>
<td>42,796</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013 Households</td>
<td>906</td>
<td>18,858</td>
<td>43,756</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018 Households</td>
<td>940</td>
<td>19,526</td>
<td>45,348</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| 2000 – 2010 Annual Rate | 8.87% | 2.54% | 2.76% |
| 2010 – 2013 Annual Rate | 0.68% | 0.68% | 0.69% |
| 2013 – 2018 Annual Rate | 0.74% | 0.70% | 0.72% |

The household count in this area has changed from 50,317 in 2010 to 50,596 in the current year, a change of 0.17% annually. The five-year projection of households is 51,352, a change of 0.30% annually from the current year total. Average household size is currently 2.61, compared to 2.61 in the year 2010. The number of families in the current year is 35,560 in the specified area.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Income</th>
<th>1-Mile Radius</th>
<th>3-Mile Radius</th>
<th>5-Mile Radius</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2013 Median Household Income</td>
<td>$135,281</td>
<td>$87,612</td>
<td>$88,090</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013 Avg Household Income</td>
<td>$164,893</td>
<td>$109,695</td>
<td>$108,643</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013 Per Capita Income</td>
<td>$63,799</td>
<td>$37,213</td>
<td>$37,633</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Current median household income is $88,090 in the area, compared to $51,314 for all U.S. households. Median household income is projected to be $97,258 in five years, compared to $59,580 for all U.S. households. Current average household income is $108,643 in this area, compared to $71,842 for all U.S. households. Average household income is projected to be $127,042 in five years, compared to $83,667 for all U.S. households. Current per capita income is $37,633 in the area, compared to the U.S. per capita income of $27,567. The per capita income is projected to be $43,939 in five years, compared to $32,073 for all U.S. households.

Housing

Currently, 79.6% of the 46,033 housing units in the area are owner occupied; 15.4%, renter occupied; and 4.9% are vacant. Currently, in the U.S., 56.4% of the housing units in the area are owner occupied; 32.3% are renter occupied; and 11.3% are vacant. In 2010, there were 44,865 housing units in the area - 81.1% owner occupied, 14.3% renter occupied, and 4.6% vacant. The annual rate of change in housing units since 2010 is 1.15%. Median home value in the area is $226,217, compared to a median home value of $177,257 for the U.S. In five years, median value is projected to change by 1.50% annually to $243,758.

The subject property is located in West Chester Township and is in the Lakota Local School District. This school district is one of Cincinnati’s largest with 18,400 students in the pre-K to 12 grades. There are 800
certified staff members and 300 support personnel. The district has four pre-K to first grade schools, ten elementary schools, four junior high schools, two freshman high schools, and two senior high schools. The school district covers 68 square miles including area in West Chester Township and Liberty Township. The graduation rate is 95.5% which is above the state average. Lakota Local School District has had the highest possible rating eight years in a row by the Ohio Department of Education and is the largest excellent with distinction district in the state of Ohio. Additionally, after eight years and three failed levies, Lakota Schools passed a 5.5 mill combination levy in November 2013 that will generate $13.8 million per year for operations and permanent improvements.

There are several small college educators located within West Chester Township including Hondros and Indiana Wesleyan. Additional educational opportunities include University of Cincinnati, Xavier University, Cincinnati State Technical and Community College, and Miami University.

### Economic Factors

#### Residential Development

There is estimated 1,025 acres of land available for residential development. At 3 homes per acre this means that an additional 3,075 homes could be built. At 2.73 residents per home, the population increase at build-out would be 8,395 more than the current population.

In the chart above development volume fell below 100 units per year in 2008 at about the time the recession hit. Assuming current trends at (say) 60 to 80 homes per year, more or less, West Chester will be fully developed in the next 40 years. The “build-out” population will be at roughly 70,000.
Commercial and Industrial Development

In the past two decades, West Chester Township has developed into a center of industrial and office activity, particularly for industrial businesses looking for large land sites. The Township’s largest employers are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>West Chester Township’s Largest Employers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Company Name</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lakota School District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dell Computer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornerstone Consolidated Services / Cinmar / Frontgate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pierre Frozen Foods</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BAE Systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amylin Ohio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>totes Isotoner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FKI Logistex (Buschman Co.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procter &amp; Gamble Manufacturing Supply Technologies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IKEA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Walgreen’s Call Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Places Moving and Storage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United HealthCare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Express</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procter &amp; Gamble Beckett Ridge Technology Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office Depot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Humana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liz Claiborne</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Motors Service Parts Operation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LensCrafters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTL Aerospace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AK Steel Corporation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There are an estimated 40,000 employees working in West Chester office, industrial, and commercial sectors. There is considerable diversity in West Chester’s business community, with no single company representing more than 3% of the Township’s employment or tax base. Historically, the manufacturing and distribution sectors represented the highest concentration of businesses in the Township, but the completion of the Union Centre Boulevard interchange is driving the diversification of the economy. Class A office development, flex office construction, and technology-related growth gained strong momentum in 2000 and 2001. The grid below reflects new commercial construction in West Chester Township from 2000 – 2012. 2013 information has not yet been released as of June 2014.
These projects represent the construction of nearly 36 million square feet of new buildings and the creation of approximately 6,000 employment positions. This development has been diversified, both from the construction and use standpoint. Development has seen a mixture of market demand and build-to-suit buildings. Development has also seen a combination of technical, manufacturing, distribution, office, and retail facilities, of which office development is starting to significantly increase. One of the key components so the Union Centre interchange district is the development of the Centre Pointe Office Park in Union Centre, the Township’s first Class A office park, which consists of five 120,000-square-foot buildings. Development of the Union Centre interchange has encouraged major development companies in the region to begin aggressive expansion in the West Chester area over the past four years. More than 20 market-demand buildings, totaling over three million square feet, have been constructed by development companies, including ProLogis, Duke-Weeks Realty, Schumacher-Dugan Construction, DA Development, K&W Development, Higgins Development Partners, Industrial Development International, and First Industrial. The second phase consists of (5) 175,000 Class A office buildings and several restaurants and hotel sites developed by Duke-Weeks. Several major state routes, including Route 4, Route 747, and Route 42 provide access through the township area. These highways provide excellent accessibility to West Chester Township from any other neighborhood in the region. Other transportation features include rail service to a majority of industrial districts and several distribution centers for products.

Bass Pro, a national hunting and fishing retailer, recently announced plans for a 150,000-square-foot location in West Chester Township near the intersection of Interstate 75 and Union Center Boulevard. Construction is set to begin in 2014 with an opening in 2015.

The original Cincinnati Bass Pro Shops Outdoor World located at Forest Fair Village is to be closed once the new location is built and ready to open. The West Chester outlet will be 20,000 square feet larger than the existing store and will feature an Uncle Buck’s Fishbowl and Grill, a nautical-themed venue for entertainment and dining that includes 12 lanes of bowling.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Commercial New Valuation</th>
<th>Residential New Valuation</th>
<th>Total New Valuation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>$39,243,940</td>
<td>$16,435,008</td>
<td>$55,678,948</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>39,798,934</td>
<td>18,093,563</td>
<td>57,892,497</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>34,198,974</td>
<td>23,813,289</td>
<td>58,012,263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>47,569,685</td>
<td>23,537,310</td>
<td>71,106,992</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>143,587,898</td>
<td>25,392,042</td>
<td>168,979,940</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>248,637,714</td>
<td>44,708,517</td>
<td>293,346,231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>134,787,651</td>
<td>61,991,526</td>
<td>196,779,177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>152,517,025</td>
<td>82,693,740</td>
<td>235,210,765</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>127,206,508</td>
<td>75,358,745</td>
<td>202,565,253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>223,163,881</td>
<td>55,145,121</td>
<td>278,309,002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>122,020,122</td>
<td>24,687,452</td>
<td>146,707,574</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>115,998,274</td>
<td>32,969,895</td>
<td>148,968,169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>96,700,000</td>
<td>20,326,653</td>
<td>117,026,653</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>$1,525,430,603</strong></td>
<td><strong>$505,152,861</strong></td>
<td><strong>$2,030,583,464</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Liberty Center

Located just north of West Chester Township in Liberty Township, is the proposed Liberty Center mixed use development. The Liberty Center development will be located along the south side of the Butler Regional Highway to the rear of properties fronting on Liberty Way and along the west side of I-75. This project will take advantage of the Liberty Way interchange, with the first phase set to open in 2015. The first phase of the project will include approximately 1.1 million square feet of retail, dining, and entertainment, including a 75,000-square-foot Class A office building, 62,000 square feet of restaurant and dining, with 190,000 square feet of upscale residential, and a 67,000-square-foot cinema and 150-room hotel.

When complete, this development will be one of the premier retail developments within the Cincinnati MSA, rivaling the Kenwood Towne Center. The developer of this project, Steiner + Associates, also developed The Green retail development in the eastern Dayton suburbs, as well as the Easton retail development in the eastern Columbus suburbs. Both of these existing developments are the premier retail destinations in their respective cities, with the Liberty Township development expected to be as highly regarded with walkable residential units and excellent accessibility via the Liberty Way interchange at I-75 as well as access to the Butler Regional Highway.

Most recent news reports that Dillard's has signed on to build a 200,000 square foot store as part of the project. The developers reported that tenants such as H&M, Express, Pink, White House Black market, Oakley, Sephora, Coach, J-Crew, Eddie Bauer, are being targeted for the development.

**Governmental Influences**

The local government for West Chester Township is comprised of three elected Township trustees and one clerk/treasurer. The Township administrator manages the day-to-day operations. West Chester Township has had an active citizens group, which has historically fought against incorporation. This has had its plusses and minuses, with businesses enjoying a rather unstructured environment to operate their businesses without paying municipal payroll taxes. West Chester Township must depend on Butler County for many of its wide-ranging services, including utility services. West Chester Township employs 82 police officers as well as 18 support staff. West Chester Township has 22 full time and 99 part time volunteer fire fighters in five stations throughout the Township. The Township road maintenance department includes 11 full time employees who are responsible for 632 miles of roads and hundreds of acres of park land.

Overall, the governmental influences of West Chester Township do not negatively impact the value of property. The absence of an earnings tax, adequate police and fire protection, and quality schools will make West Chester Township a desirable area for development in the future.

**Environmental Factors**

Environmental considerations consist of certain features that are contained in or affect the neighborhood or its geographic location. One of the most positive influences on the subject neighborhood is its location and proximity to several major highways providing transportation amenities for commerce and industry. This includes two major interstates, I-75 through the central core, I-275 on southern border. Several major state routes, including Route 4, Route 747, and Route 42 provide access through the township area. These highways provide excellent accessibility to West Chester Township from any other neighborhood in the
region. Other transportation features include rail service to a majority of industrial districts and several distribution centers for products.

West Chester Township monitors all permitting and zoning issues. Industrial districts which encompass the primary area for industrial development are located in the southeast sections of West Chester Township extending west of the Consolidated Rail Line and Cincinnati Dayton Road and primarily south of Beckett Road and Port Union Roads. The southeast section of West Chester Township is almost exclusively zoned for M-2. These M-2 uses are adjacent to areas within the City of Fairfield, which are also zoned industrial. Commercial districts in West Chester Township are limited and the primary commercial district for West Chester Township is located at I-75 and Tylersville Road surrounding the Voice of America Retail Development. This area includes a Meijer, Lowe’s, Home Depot, Target, Wal-Mart, Kohl’s Department Store, Super Kroger, and other similar and related uses. Other commercial districts are (1) located along U.S. 42 in the Pisgah section of West Chester Township, (2) along Cincinnati Dayton Road south of Tylersville Road, (3) at Union Center at I-75 and (4) at State Route 747 in the northwestern section of the township. Other than these districts, commercial uses are limited throughout the area.

The primary portion of the neighborhood is served with all public utilities of which there is adequate supply, and the cost has remained in balance. Telephone service is provided by Cincinnati Bell, Cincinnati Gas and Electric provide electricity and gas, water is provided by Butler County Water, and the Metropolitan Sewer District provides sewer. A benefit of Butler County is that there is an underground aquifer from which the township draws its water. This aquifer is among the largest in the United States and current usage has tapped only a fraction of its potential. Two sewage-treatment plants process normal sewage as well as most forms of industrial waste.

**Immediate Neighborhood**

Just to the west of the subject is the site of the future Liberty Center. At this point we can only imagine the impact of a 1,106,000 square foot, $192,500,000 investment in a regional shopping destination located at the neighborhoods back door. Although occupancy is not scheduled until 2015, the lead time needed in commercial development means that Liberty Center is and will be a factor in all development decisions going forward. Across from the planned Liberty Center is a planned Cabelas store that is under final planning approval with West Chester Township, and should be open sometime in 2015.

First, the capacity of the east-west connecting roads that cross over I-75, Tylersville and Liberty Way, are already testing their practical limits in terms of capacity. While Liberty Way has relieved some pressure from the Tylersville Road at I-75 interchange, any improvement will be eclipsed by the traffic generated once Liberty Center is open for business.

**Conclusion:**

In summary, the subject’s West Chester Township area saw substantial growth from 2001 through 2008 with the subject’s location within the existing growth patterns. This growth has slowed to lower, stabilized increase in the past five years. As evidenced by historical building permits issued, demand has stabilized since a substantial decline from 2004 - 2008. Based on the demographics cited, the area is projected to have a steadily increasing population with strong average household income.
REAL ESTATE TAX DATA

The subject property is located within West Chester Township, Butler County, Ohio. In Ohio, real estate taxes are handled on a county level. The county treasurer establishes the tax rates for the various political divisions in the district throughout the county. The auditor assesses properties, establishing the total true value of real property. The treasurer calculates and collects the taxes due.

The real estate assessment percentage in Ohio is 35% of the total true market value. The total true value of the real estate generally equates to the fair market value. The assessed value is then multiplied by the effective tax rate.

Taxes are payable on a semi-annual basis, usually in February and August, twelve months in arrears. The February bill pays the taxes for the previous January to June of the preceding year. Tax complaints must be filed by March 31st, and the lien date for the complaint is the preceding January 1st. For example, if the valuation date of January 1, 2013 is contested, the complaint must be filed by March 31, 2014.

The subject property is assessed by the Butler County Auditor’s office as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>35%</th>
<th>100%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Land</td>
<td>$20,590</td>
<td>$58,820</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improvements</td>
<td>$0</td>
<td>$0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>$20,590</strong></td>
<td><strong>$58,820</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Current Annual Taxes: $1,586.99

The current effective tax rate for commercial and industrial properties in West Chester Township in the Lakota Local School District is $77.075548 per $1,000.00 of assessed valuation. The effective tax rate for the subject property compares favorably with those in other districts of Butler County. The effective tax rate for the subject property is at the middle of the range compared with those in other districts of the Cincinnati MSA. Therefore, the expected level of taxes will not constrain the marketability of the subject property.

The subject property is a tax-exempt property, as it is owned by a governmental agency. At the time the subject transfers to a private party that results in a change in ownership, as well as a loss of tax-exempt status. In the event of a sale of the subject that would result in a loss of tax exempt status, the sale price would most likely be adopted by the Auditor as a reflection of the true market value of the subject. For this reason, the value conclusion in this report would be the most reliable predictor of future taxes.
SITE DATA

The subject property is located at the southwest corner of Liberty Way and Cox Road in West Chester Township, Butler County, Ohio 45069.

The subject site consists of 4.289 gross acres, with 0.467 acres located within the right-of-way of Liberty Way, leaving a net land area of 3.822 acres. The subject has 471.71 feet of frontage on the west side of Cox Road and 512.52 of frontage on the south side of Liberty Way, and is irregular in shape. The shape and dimensions can be seen on the site plan above.

Based on discussions with the Butler County Transportation Improvement District, the subject will have full-movement access on Cox Road at the southern-most portion of the property on Cox Road at the southern-most portion of the property. The subject will not have access on Liberty Way.

A small portion of the western portion of the subject property is zoned M-1, Light Industrial, while the remainder...
of the site is zoned A-1, Agricultural. Based on discussions with the West Chester Township Zoning and Planning Department, the subject property is located in the Office/Retail Land Use on the most recent 2013 Land Use Plan. According to the zoning department, the agricultural designation is simply a holding designation for the subject property until such time as a development is proposed for the subject, at which point the zoning will be changed based on the proposed use. According to the zoning department, the subject property would most likely be used for any number of office or commercial uses on the subject property, likely under a PD, Planned Development classification. For purposes of this report, all commercial and office uses under the various classifications of the West Chester Township Zoning Code are considered to be legally permissible.

Topography: The subject topography is level to slightly rolling.

Utilities: The subject property is located in a commercial district with all public utilities available.

Deed Restrictions and Easements: No known restrictions other than standard utility easements.

Flood Map Data: The subject property is located in a Flood Zone X, known as an area outside the floodplain. The subject property is contained on Federal Emergency Management Agency Community Panel No. 39017C0332E with an effective date of December 17, 2010.

Site Improvements: The subject property is currently vacant with no site improvements other than natural growth.

Summary: The subject site is well situated to accommodate a wide number of uses given its location at the southwest corner of Liberty Way and Cox Road in the northern portion of West Chester Township. This area of West Chester Township will soon see the new Liberty Center development, as well as a proposed Cabela’s retail store less than a quarter mile west of the subject property. This area has seen increased demand with the installation of the Liberty Way interchange on I-75 just west of the subject.
PART IV. ANALYSIS OF DATA AND CONCLUSIONS

HIGHEST AND BEST USE

The following definition of highest and best use appears in the fifth edition of The Dictionary of Real Estate Appraisal (Appraisal Institute, Chicago, 2010).

*The reasonably probable and legal use of vacant land or an improved property, which is physically possible, appropriately supported, financially feasible, and that results in the highest value. The four criteria the highest and best use must meet are legal permissibility, physical possibility, financial feasibility, and maximum profitability.*

When one estimates highest and best use, the property must first be analyzed as though vacant. In this stage the existing improvements, buildings, site improvements, and underground improvements are assumed nonexistent. A conclusion is made about the use that meets the four criteria of the highest and best use definition.

From this analysis one must conclude to leave the site vacant or construct the ideal improvement. The ideal improvement provides all of the characteristics that are demanded by the market, and is defined by the fifth edition of The Dictionary of Real Estate Appraisal as:

*The improvement that takes maximum advantage of the site’s potential given market demand, conforms to current market standards and the character of the market area, and contains the most suitably priced components; the improvement that represents the highest and best use of the land as though vacant.*

The next step is to compare the ideal improvement with the existing improvement. From this comparison, a decision is made to leave the improvements as is or to change them. The potential changes include demolition, remodeling, renovation, or conversion to a new use.

By comparing the ideal improvement with the subject property, depreciation and obsolescence are identified. Physical depreciation results from deterioration of the subject improvements over time relative to the ideal improvement. Functional obsolescence is depreciation that relates to superadequate or deficient physical elements that do not conform to the physical elements of the ideal improvement. External obsolescence is depreciation that affects subject improvements from outside the subject site and can be suggested when the ideal improvement is substantially different from the existing improvement in terms of scope, scale, type, nature, or timing.

Following is the highest and best use analysis of the subject property.

**Highest and Best Use As If Vacant and Available for Development**

Legally Permissible

The subject property is located within the zoning jurisdiction of West Chester Township, Butler County, Ohio. As described under the site description, the subject currently has a holding designation of primarily A-1, Agricultural. After discussions with Brian Behrmann, director of planning for West Chester Township, the subject will mostly likely have a zoning change to a Commercial Planned Development District once a
development plan is submitted. Based on discussions, the township is open to a variety of commercial and office possibilities for the subject property. The legally permissible use of the subject property is likely any commercial or office type development within the West Chester Township commercial classifications.

Any proposed rezoning plan is subject to approval of a development plan. Permitted uses include uses permitted or conditional in O-1, B-2, B-1, and B-2 zoning. Common area open space is 15% for both C-PUD and SP-PUD. All other restrictions are incorporated in the approved plan.

Physically Possible

The subject site consists of an irregular-shaped corner parcel containing 3.822 net acres with over 470 feet of frontage on Cox Road and over 510 feet of frontage on Liberty Way. Based on discussions with the Butler County Transportation Improvement District, the subject will not have access from Liberty Way, but will have full-movement access on Cox Road toward the southern portion of the subject property. The subject property is level to gently rolling, and is located outside of any designated floodplain area.

The subject location is best described as a gateway between the Tylersville Road commercial district and the expanding Cincinnati-Dayton Road/Liberty Township commercial district. This district will soon include the Liberty Centre development less than one-half mile west of the subject property on the north side of Liberty Way across I-75. This Liberty Centre development will result in over 1,100,000 square feet of new office and retail space, as well as hotel and residential units within the next 24 months. Across from the planned Liberty Center is a planned Cabelas store that is under final planning approval with West Chester Township, and should be open sometime in 2015. In addition, Children’s Hospital at Liberty Towne Centre development is expanding the hospital facility in 2014-2015. The University Hospital campus in West Chester Township on Cox Road has also seen growth with additions, as well as medical office development surrounding the facility. The subject property is well positioned as a gateway at the intersection of Liberty Way and Cox Road, just east of I-75. The physically possible uses of the subject property include all the legally permissible uses determined to be primarily commercial and office uses.

Financially Feasible

Financially feasible uses of the site depend upon the improvements developed and whether or not a positive return can be generated over and above the cost of the improvements, plus the amount paid for the raw ground.

Based on the above legally permissible and physically possible uses, primarily all commercial and office uses are considered legally permissible and physically possible. To determine of the financially feasible uses of the site, the 1st Quarter 2014 Colliers International Office Market Summary estimates that there is 2,550,755 square feet of office space in the I-75 Corridor North, of which the West Chester area is a part. There is approximately 94,551 square feet vacant, equating to a current vacancy rate of 3.71%. Of this classification, only 0.88% of Class A space is vacant, while 6.89% of Class B is vacant and 10.05% of Class C space is vacant. This market saw 18,448 square feet of total absorption in the first quarter 2014. Rental rates for all classes is $13.84 per square foot, with $18.99 for Class A space, $13.29 for Class B space, and $12.30 for Class C space.
Retail: In the table below, the Colliers International Retail Market Survey, 1st Quarter 2014 was also obtained. This report breaks out 67 different individual submarkets within the Cincinnati MSA. Of these 67 submarkets, four are considered applicable to the subject property and include the Liberty Township, Tylersville, Union Centre, and West Chester submarkets. These submarkets are shown below. The subject is most closely related to the Liberty Township and Tylersville submarkets, as the Liberty Way and Cox Road intersection is the border between the two submarkets. For first quarter 2014, the Liberty Township submarket had a 12.27% vacancy rate with 432,170 total square feet, while the Tylersville submarket had 2.82% vacancy rate with 1,387,200 square feet of retail space. Total for the four submarkets that comprise the area surrounding the subject property are 3,619,887 square feet, of which 8.34% was vacant in the first quarter 2014. Rental rates ranged from $11.47 to $14.53 per square foot, with an average of the four submarkets at $13.06 per square foot. To these submarkets will be an additional over one million square feet of retail space added in the next two years, which will be primarily pre-leased prior to coming online. Many of the retailers to the Liberty Centre site are new to the market or new to this submarket, and should not cannibalize other retail space within this market. This development should also span new development surrounding the Liberty Center on land not owned by the developers of this site.

While the overall rental rates for office space are higher than the overall rental rates for retail space, due to the subject’s highly-desirable location at the crossroads between the Tylersville commercial market and the Liberty Township/Cincinnati-Dayton Road commercial district, the financially feasible use is determined to be either Class A office, hotel or retail development. According to West Chester Township, there are only two hotels in the Tylersville Road market, both located in inferior areas farther from the highway.

Maximally Productive

Based on the legally permissible, physically possible, and financially feasible uses, the maximally productive use is determined to be destination commercial. As noted previously, the subject is at the crossroads of the areas between the Tylersville commercial district and the Liberty Township/Cincinnati-Dayton Road commercial district, and the Liberty Centre is underway less than a half mile west of the subject property, as well as the announcement of a proposed Cabela’s outdoor outfitter retailer less than a quarter mile west of the subject property between I-75 and Tylers Place, on the south side of Liberty Way. The maximally productive use of the subject property, based on these factors, is for retail use, including potentially a hotel.
SALES COMPARISON APPROACH

The subject property is valued as a vacant parcel based on the conclusion of the highest and best use, and the sales comparison approach is used to estimate its value as if vacant and available for development. The basic steps to the sales comparison approach are as follows.

1. The subject site is analyzed, and market data is gathered.
2. The market data is analyzed, verified, and compared with the subject site.
3. An appropriate unit of comparison is selected, and the sales are compared with the subject property based on the unit of comparison.
4. The market value of the property is based on a value conclusion, within a range, that is based on the indicated value from the sale properties, after adjustments for differences.

Unit of Comparison

The unit of comparison used to estimate the market value of the subject property is the price per square-foot of land area. The price per square foot is a commonly quoted unit of comparison, for the size and type of vacant land. This unit of comparison is quoted by sellers and agents of this type of property, and is considered by buyers. This unit of comparison will be used to value the subject property.

The following are six comparable sales of land in the immediate and surrounding areas which are considered good indicators of value for the subject property.
LAND SALE NO. 1

Location 9226 Schulze Drive, West Chester Township, Butler County, Ohio
Tax ID M5620-416.000-008
School District Lakota Local School District

Sale Data
Grantor Max & Erma’s
Grantee Shihasi Union Centre, LLP
Sale Date September 16, 2011
Property Rights Fee Simple
Conditions of Sale Arms Length
Financing Conventional
Highest and Best Use Commercial
Verification Bill King with representative of grantee

Sale Price $1,125,000 + $8,000 demolition = $1,133,000

Land Data
Zoning CBD
Topography Relatively level
Utilities All public available
Shape Irregular
Flood Info Areas of Minimal Flooding
Use as of date of sale Vacant
Encumbrances Normal
Motivation of Parties Buyer: To construct a hotel

Land Size Information
Land Size 2.102 acres, or 91,563 SF

Indicators
Sale Price/Usable SF $12.37

Analysis of Pertinent Data
This property is located in the southwest quadrant of Union Centre Boulevard at the southbound I-75 access ramp. Access to the property is via Schulze Drive, which is a service road in the area. Currently, the site is improved with a restaurant formerly occupied by Max & Erma’s. Plans call for the existing improvements to be demolished and a hotel to be constructed. The site sits down from Union Centre Boulevard with blocked visibility.
3.822 Net Acres of Vacant Land
Southwest Corner of Liberty Way and Cox Road
West Chester Township, Butler County, Ohio 45069
LAND SALE NO. 2

Location: 9306 Schulze Drive, West Chester Township, Butler County, Ohio
Tax ID: M5620-417.000-006
School District: Lakota Local School District

Sale Data:
Grantor: Centre Place Retail LLC (Schumacher Dugan Construction Co.)
Grantee: Sterling Hospitality LLC
Sale Date: September 12, 2012
Property Rights: Fee Simple
Conditions of Sale: Arms Length
Financing: Cash or Equivalent
Verification: Brian Gleckler with grantor representative at Schumacher Dugan

Sale Price: $1,750,000

Land Data:
Zoning: CBD
Topography: Relatively level
Utilities: All public available
Shape: Irregular
Flood Info: Areas of Minimal Flooding
Use as of date of sale: Vacant
Encumbrances: Normal
Motivation of Parties: Buyer: To construct a hotel

Land Size Information:
Useable Land Size: 2.777 Acres or 120,966 SF

Indicators:
Sale Price/Useable SF: $14.47

Analysis of Pertinent Data:
This is the site for a proposed 125 unit hotel. This property is located in a commercial sub-division located the southwest quadrant of Union Centre Boulevard and I-75. Access to the property is via Schulze Drive, which is a service road in the area. There is frontage and on Muhlhauser Road but no curb-cuts on to Muhlhauser Road. The intersection of Muhlhauser Road and Schulze Drive is signalized. There is a turn lane allowing southbound interstate traffic to turn left on to Schulze. This development is almost entirely highway service oriented businesses including restaurants and hotels. This site was officially listed for sale by Schumacher Dugan for an undisclosed price and negotiations between buyer and seller resulted in a sale price at $1,750,000. The seller indicated that had they received the contract to construct the hotel, the sale price of the site would have been discounted, but since they did not, they commanded a market price for the site.
3.822 Net Acres of Vacant Land
Southwest Corner of Liberty Way and Cox Road
West Chester Township, Butler County, Ohio 45069
LAND SALE NO. 3

Property Type | Commercial Development Land
Location | Northeast corner of Cincinnati-Dayton Road and Wyandot Lane, Liberty Township, Butler County, Ohio
Tax ID | D2020-047.000-004, -005, -006 & D2010-013.000-114 & -124

Sale Data
Grantor | Mark Sennett & Beckmark Inc.
Grantee | 6650 Cincinnati Dayton Road, LLC
Sale Date | November 27 2013
Property Rights | Fee Simple
Conditions of Sale | Arms Length
Financing | Cash or Equivalent
Verification | Todd Schmutte confirmed with Mark Sennett, broker and grantor

Sale Price | $836,000

Land Data
Zoning | B-PUD, Business–Planned Unit Development
Topography | Level
Utilities | All public available
Shape | Rectangle
Flood Info | Area of minimal flooding
Present Use | Homes awaiting demolition
Encumbrances | Normal
Motivation of Parties | Seller: To divest; Buyer: For development of a multi-tenant retail center

Land Size Information
Useable Land Size | 2.213 Acres or 96,398 SF

Indicators
Sale Price/Useable SF | $8.67

Analysis of Pertinent Data
This is the purchase of five parcels located at the northeast corner of Cincinnati-Dayton Road and Wyandot Lane in Liberty Township, Butler County. The grantor had assembled these properties since 2005, including four single-family residences, one of which has been demolished, with three needing to be demolished prior to construction. The buyer intends on constructing a multi-tenant retail center. The property is located on Cincinnati-Dayton Road, north of Liberty One Drive, in the area of Liberty Township just north of the Kroger-anchored retail center, the Cincinnati Children’s Hospital, and just west of Lakota East High School. Wyandot Lane has a traffic-light-controlled intersection with Cincinnati-Dayton Road, and this sale has 300’ of frontage on the east side of Cincinnati-Dayton Road, as well as 320’ of frontage on the north side of Wyandot Lane. This property is located will be the farthest north point of the Cincinnati-Dayton Road retail corridor upon completion with residential uses immediately north that are zoned commercial and may be redeveloped in the future.
3.822 Net Acres of Vacant Land
Southwest Corner of Liberty Way and Cox Road
West Chester Township, Butler County, Ohio 45069
LAND SALE NO. 4

Property Type: Retail Development Land
Location: West side of Mason-Montgomery Road, south of Deerfield Boulevard, Deerfield Township, Warren County, Ohio
Tax ID: 16-32-286-020

Sale Data
Grantor: JHSI Real Estate LLC
Grantee: Midland Deerfield I, LLC
Sale Date: December 18, 2012
Property Rights: Fee Simple
Conditions of Sale: Arms Length
Financing: Cash
Highest & Best Use: Retail development
Verification: Todd Schmutte with Brian Graham, broker; (513) 562-2214

Sale Price: $1,450,000 (Includes demolition)

Land Data
Zoning: General Business PUD
Topography: Generally Level
Utilities: All Public Available
Shape: Irregular
Flood Info: Area of Minimal Flooding
Present Use: Vacant
Encumbrances: Normal
Motivation of Parties: Grantor: to sell vacant building; grantee: for redevelopment

Land Size Information
Gross Land Size: 3.425 Acres or 149,193 SF
Usable Land Size: 3.425 Acres or 149,193 SF

Indicators
Sale Price/Usable SF: $9.72

Analysis of Pertinent Data
This sale was the purchase of a former Jewish Hospital medical office building. The buyer purchased the property with the intent to demolish the medical office building and redeveloped with a two-building, 17,650-square-foot, multi-tenant retail complex. This property has cross and access easements with the adjoining property to the north. The total cost for the demolition of the medical office building was estimated by the broker to be $50,000. The purchase price was $1,400,000.
3.822 Net Acres of Vacant Land
Southwest Corner of Liberty Way and Cox Road
West Chester Township, Butler County, Ohio 45069
## LAND SALE NO. 5

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Property Type</th>
<th>Commercial Development Land</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Northeast corner of Muhlhauser Road and Allen Road, West Chester Township, Butler County, Ohio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tax ID</td>
<td>M5610-032.000-096</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School District</td>
<td>Lakota Local School District</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Sale Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grantor</th>
<th>Janaka Landen Ltd.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grantee</td>
<td>Union Centre Innkeepers, LLC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sale Date</td>
<td>September 13, 2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Property Rights</td>
<td>Fee Simple</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conditions of Sale</td>
<td>Arms Length</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financing</td>
<td>Cash</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verification</td>
<td>Mike Halonen, broker, confirmed with Todd Schmutte, June 18, 2014</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Sale Price

$2,175,000

### Land Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Zoning</th>
<th>CBD, Central Business District</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Topography</td>
<td>Level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utilities</td>
<td>All public available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shape</td>
<td>Triangular</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flood Info</td>
<td>Area of minimal flooding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Present Use</td>
<td>Vacant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Encumbrances</td>
<td>Normal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motivation of Parties</td>
<td>Seller: To divest; Buyer: For development of Holiday Inn</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Land Size Information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gross Land Size</th>
<th>5.210 Acres or 226,948 SF</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Useable Land Size</td>
<td>4.670 Acres or 203,425 SF</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Indicators

| Sale Price/Useable SF    | $10.69                           |

### Analysis of Pertinent Data

This property is located at the northeast corner of Muhlhauser Road and Allen Road in West Chester Township, just south of Union Centre Boulevard, and was purchased for the construction of a 6-story, 128-room Holiday Inns and Suites. When complete, this will be a hotel and conference center with event and banquet center, and will be operated by Middletown Hotel Management. The facility will contain 116,000 square feet. The owners expect the opening in 2015. The gross land size of the property is 5.210 acres, of which approximately 0.54 acres are located within the right-of-way of Allen Road, leaving a net usable land size of 4.670 acres.
3.822 Net Acres of Vacant Land
Southwest Corner of Liberty Way and Cox Road
West Chester Township, Butler County, Ohio 45069

Photo – Land Sale 5

Plat – Land Sale 5
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Property Type</th>
<th>Commercial Development Land</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Location</td>
<td>North side of Liberty Way, west of I-75, Liberty Township, Butler County, Ohio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tax ID</td>
<td>D2010-013.000-054, -055, D2020-100.000-002, -004, -005 and -006</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Sale Data**

| Grantor               | John L. Prather, Chan J. Park and ZZ Builders, LLC |
| Grantee               | Libertytown, LLC                                   |
| Sale Date             | January 2 & 15, 2013 & February 15, 2013          |
| Property Rights       | Fee Simple                                        |
| Conditions of Sale    | Arms Length                                       |
| Financing             | Cash                                             |
| Verification          | Todd Schmutte confirmed with Mark Sennett, broker |

**Sale Price**

$2,850,000

**Land Data**

| Zoning                | B-PUD, Business–Planned Unit Development         |
| Topography            | Level                                            |
| Utilities             | All public available                             |
| Shape                 | Irregular                                        |
| Flood Info            | Area of minimal flooding                         |
| Present Use           | Four homes to be demolished for redevelopment    |
| Encumbrances          | Normal                                           |
| Motivation of Parties | Sellers: To divest; Buyer: For development of Phase I of Liberty Center |

**Land Size Information**

| Useable Land Size     | 3.911 Acres or 170,363 square-feet               |

**Indicators**

| Sale Price/Useable SF | $16.73                                           |

**Analysis of Pertinent Data**

This assembled property is located within Phase I of the planned, to-be-developed Steiner + Associates’ Liberty Center. This assembled property is the last three property owner holdouts along Liberty Way that was not purchased as one larger purchase by Steiner + Associates or under contract with Steiner + Associates (50 acres of Phase I controlled by one third party). One broker represented each of the last three remaining holdouts. These tracts were negotiated separately by the broker. The smallest tract containing 0.574 acres of net land and one single-family dwelling that needed to be removed sold for $550,000 ($22.00/SF). The middle sized tract containing 1.651 acres of net land and one single-family dwelling that needed to be removed sold for $1,000,000 ($15.20/SF) and had limited frontage. The largest tract containing 1.686 acres of net land and two single-family dwellings that needed to be removed sold for $1,300,000 ($17.70/SF) and had more frontage than rear width.
3.822 Net Acres of Vacant Land
Southwest Corner of Liberty Way and Cox Road
West Chester Township, Butler County, Ohio 45069
3.822 Net Acres of Vacant Land
Southwest Corner of Liberty Way and Cox Road
West Chester Township, Butler County, Ohio 45069
Recap: Comparable Land Sales

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Sale 1</th>
<th>Sale 2</th>
<th>Sale 3</th>
<th>Sale 4</th>
<th>Sale 5</th>
<th>Sale 6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Location:</td>
<td>SWC of Liberty Way &amp; Cox Road, West Chester Township, Butler County, Ohio</td>
<td>9226 Schulze Drive, West Chester Township, Butler County, Ohio</td>
<td>9306 Schulze Drive, West Chester Township, Butler County, Ohio</td>
<td>Northeast corner of Cincinnati-Dayton Road &amp; Wyandot Lane, Liberty Township, Warren County, Ohio</td>
<td>West side of Mason-Montgomery Road @ Allen Road, West Chester Township, Butler County, Ohio</td>
<td>North side of Liberty Way, east of the subject, Liberty Township, Butler County, Ohio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sale Price:</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>$1,133,000</td>
<td>$1,750,000</td>
<td>$836,000</td>
<td>$1,450,000</td>
<td>$2,175,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Site Size:</td>
<td>166,486 SF</td>
<td>91,563 SF</td>
<td>120,966 SF</td>
<td>96,398 SF</td>
<td>149,193 SF</td>
<td>203,425 SF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Price/SF:</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>$12.37</td>
<td>$14.47</td>
<td>$8.67</td>
<td>$9.72</td>
<td>$10.64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zoning:</td>
<td>Commercial</td>
<td>CBD</td>
<td>CBD</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>GB-PUD</td>
<td>CBD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utilities:</td>
<td>All public available</td>
<td>All public available</td>
<td>All public available</td>
<td>All public available</td>
<td>All public available</td>
<td>All public available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Hotel</td>
<td>Hotel</td>
<td>Retail</td>
<td>Retail</td>
<td>Hotel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topography:</td>
<td>Level</td>
<td>Level</td>
<td>Level</td>
<td>Level</td>
<td>Level</td>
<td>Level</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### ADJUSTMENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Buyer Expenditures</th>
<th>N/A</th>
<th>Similar</th>
<th>Similar</th>
<th>Similar</th>
<th>Similar</th>
<th>Similar</th>
<th>Similar</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Property Rights</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Similar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financing Terms</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Similar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conditions of Sale</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Similar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Market Conditions</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Inferior</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Superior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Superior</td>
<td>Superior</td>
<td>Inferior</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Superior</td>
<td>Superior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Size</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Superior</td>
<td>Superior</td>
<td>Superior</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Inferior</td>
<td>Superior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical Characteristics</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Superior</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Similar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zoning</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Similar</td>
<td>Similar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Comparison</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Superior</td>
<td>Superior</td>
<td>Inferior</td>
<td>Superior</td>
<td>Superior</td>
<td>Superior</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The six comparable sales above reflect a selling price per square foot range from a low of $8.67 per square foot to a high of $16.73 per square foot.

### Discussion of Adjustments

**Buyer Expenditures**

This adjustment accounts for an amount that a buyer spent as extraordinary or abnormal expense incurred by the buyer. Sales 1, 3, 4, and 6 were the purchase of sites improved with existing structures in need of demolition upon purchase. As the demolition costs were included with the overall price, no adjustment is required. Sales 2 and 5 were vacant sites, similar to the subject property, requiring no adjustment.

**Property Rights Conveyed**

All six comparable sales reflect the transfer of fee simple interest. The fee simple interest of the subject site is being appraised and, as such, is similar to all six comparable sales, requiring no adjustment for property rights conveyed.
Financing Terms

All of the sales transactions reflect cash to the seller. Therefore, no adjustments are needed.

Conditions of Sale

Sales 1, 2, 3, 4, and 5 reflect arms-length transactions from grantor to grantee and, as such, are considered similar to the subject, requiring no adjustment. Assembled Sale 6 was three purchases by a holding company of Steiner + Associates for the proposed Liberty Center development on the north side of Liberty Way at I-75. Steiner + Associates has already purchased a large portion of the rear land slated for Phase I, as well as some frontage in one large purchase for $8 million in January 2012. This total purchase was for 59.655 acres, and was purchased at $134,104 per acre. Steiner also has a contract to purchase the eastern 50+ acres of the Phase I development from a third party. Comparable Sale 6 is the assemblage of three holdouts that did not initially agree to the initial purchase by a developer who had assembled the 59.655 acres, and gambled that Steiner + Associates would still want their property and would pay a premium once the assemblage was purchased and the project neared groundbreaking. This assembled sale is considered superior with regard to conditions of sale, requiring a downward adjustment.

Market Conditions

The six comparable sales took place as follows: Sale 1 – September 2011; Sale 2 – September 2012; Sale 3 – November 2013; Sale 4 – December 2012; Sale 5 – September 2012; and Sale 6 – January and February 2013. Comparable Sale 1, which occurred in September 2011 toward the end of the recessionary period, is considered inferior to the subject, requiring upward adjustment. Sales 2, 3, 4, 5, and 6 transferred between September 2012 and November 2013 in a time period considered relatively similar to that of the subject property. No adjustment is required for Sales 2, 3, 4, 5, and 6.

Location

As mentioned, the subject property is located at the southwest corner of Liberty Way and Cox Road in West Chester Township, Butler County, Ohio. This property is located just east of I-75.

Sales 1 and 2 are both located on Schulze Drive in West Chester Township, Butler County, Ohio, just south of Union Centre Boulevard. Sale 1 has good visibility from I-75, while Sale 2 has limited visibility but is located on the Muhlhauser Road frontage, while Sale 1 is an interior lot on Schulze Drive. Both of these properties have excellent accessibility to the Union Centre interchange at I-75, with good or limited visibility from I-75. The Union Centre Boulevard interchange is a more desirable location within West Chester Township than the subject’s location, and each sale is considered superior to the subject, requiring a downward adjustment.

Sale 3 is located at the northeast corner of Cincinnati-Dayton Road and Wyandot Lane, north of the Kroger-anchored retail center and Cincinnati Children’s Hospital. This sale, while on a desirable corner location within Liberty Township, is located at the north end of the Cincinnati-Dayton Road retail corridor, and is considered inferior to the subject’s location, requiring an upward adjustment.

Sale 4 is located on the west side of Mason-Montgomery Road across from Parkway Drive between Natorp Boulevard and Deerfield Boulevard in Deerfield Township, Warren County, Ohio. This property is located in the fast growing Deerfield Township area near the city of Mason. The overall location of this sale is considered similar to the location of the subject property, requiring no adjustment.
Sale 5 is located at the northeast corner of Muhlhauser Road and Allen Road, just south of Union Centre Boulevard, in West Chester Township, Butler County. This property has excellent highway accessibility similar to the subject’s highway accessibility at Union Centre Boulevard. The Union Centre area is considered superior to the subject’s location, as the Liberty Centre development is just underway. In time, this location will likely be inferior, but at the time Sale 5 was purchased versus the time that the subject property is appraised, the overall location of sale 5 is considered slightly superior to the subject property, requiring a downward adjustment.

Assembled Sale 6 is three properties that are all located near a proposed access for Phase I of the Liberty Center development. These properties are located within the proposed Phase I, and as such, will have a development pattern that will occur sooner than any proposed development for the subject property. The overall location of this assembled sale is considered superior to the subject, requiring a downward adjustment.

Economic Size

The six comparable sales have site size as follows: Sale 1 – 91,563 square feet; Sale 2 – 120,966 square feet; Sale 3 – 96,398 square feet; Sale 4 – 149,193 square feet; Sale 5 – 203,425 square feet; and Sale 6 – 170,363 square feet. The subject property contains 166,486 square-feet of net land area. Based on the theories of economies of scale, larger quantities of a good tend to sell at a lower unit price than smaller quantities of the same good. That translates into smaller sites selling for a higher price on a per unit basis than similar larger tracts. Basically, this translates into larger sites increasing holding costs for developers, thus decreasing the amount they can afford to pay for raw ground to make projects economically feasible, although this is less relevant when considering single-tenant outlot-type properties. Sales 1, 2, and 3 are all considered superior to the subject property, requiring downward adjustments. Sale 6 is also considered superior as it was three purchased assembled into one parcel near the size of the subject, requiring a downward adjustment. Sale 4 is considered relatively similar to the subject property, requiring no adjustment, while Sale 5 is considered slightly inferior to the subject property, requiring a slight upward adjustment.

Physical Characteristics

Physical characteristics include such items as configuration, topography, utilities, access, etc. The subject has frontage at the corner of Liberty Way and Cox Road, with generally level topography, access to all public utilities, and is limited to one access point on Cox Road.

Sale 1 has a level topography with availability to all public utilities, with good depth-to-width ratio. The overall physical characteristics of this sale with one access point are considered similar to the subject property, requiring no adjustment.

Sale 2 has frontage on Muhlhauser Road and Schulze Drive, with access from Schulze Drive, with good shape for development. The physical characteristics of this site are considered superior to the subject property, requiring downward adjustment.

Sale 3 is a roughly square-shaped site at the corner of Cincinnati-Dayton Road and Wyadot Lane. The property has generally level topography, and will likely have one or two access points, although access from Cincinnati-Dayton Road may be difficult to obtain, and the site may utilize the Wyandot Lane frontage for access with a traffic light located at Wyandot and Cincinnati-Dayton Road. The physical characteristics of this sale are considered relatively similar to that of the subject, requiring no adjustment.
Sale 4 is a trapezoidal-shaped lot with more depth than frontage. This property is level and is an interior lot with a single access point. The physical characteristics of this site are considered relatively similar to that of the subject, requiring no adjustment.

Sale 5 will likely have access from both Allen Road and Muhlhauser Road, but is a triangular-shaped parcel. The access of this sale is considered superior, while the shape is considered inferior with regard to development. Overall, this property is considered relatively similar to the subject, requiring no adjustment.

Assembled Sale 6 has a generally level topography and availability to all public utilities. This site is three irregular-shaped tracts that, together, have a rectangular shape. Access for this property will through the Liberty Centre development, as this was purchased as assemblage for that development. The physical characteristics of this property are considered relatively similar to the subject, requiring no adjustment.

Zoning

The subject property, when purchased for development, will likely be rezoned for commercial development in a Planned Unit Development type district. Each of the six sales was zoned for commercial use, with three of the six sales within a Business-Planned Unit Development district. Sales 1, 2, and 5 were located in a zoning classification that, while not a Planned Unit Development, still required additional approval from the Township Trustees. On an overall basis, the zoning of each sale is considered relatively similar to the subject, requiring no adjustment.

Summary and Conclusion

The six sales indicated a price per square foot range from a low of $8.67 per square foot to a high of $16.73 per square foot. In terms of comparability to the subject, Sales 1, 2, 5, and 6 were all considered slightly superior or superior to the subject property. Sale 3, due primarily to its inferior location to the subject, is considered overall to be inferior to the subject, while Sale 4 was considered relatively similar to the subject property.

Other sales not utilized above, but in need of discussion, is the cumulative assemblage land sale that took place between January 2008 and January 2009. This sale was eventually combined with other properties and assembled as part of the $8 million sale discussed previously. This particular sale was a combination of 7.326 acres that included primarily frontage properties along Liberty Way east of the subject property that was purchased for $3,350,000 from five separate grantors and purchased by one grantee assembling property. This property sold during superior market conditions with a total assemblage price of $457,275 per acre ($10.50/SF) and included four single-family residences, as well as a commercial landscaping business. This property also required demolition costs that are not included in the aforementioned assemblage price.

Also noted is the pending sale of approximately 11 acres along the west side of I-75, the south side of Liberty Way, with access from Tylers Place Boulevard, just west of the subject property. This 11 acres has been submitted for approval for a Cabela’s big-box retail site. Details of the purchase were not able to be determined. It is noted that with the submission of this development plan by Great Traditions Development, that this site will also create three additional developed sites, including between 1.70 and 2.54 acres along Tylers Place Boulevard and Liberty Way, less than a half mile west of the subject property.
Based on the six sales presented, as well as knowledge of other commercial tracts in the area, a value of $10.00 per square foot is felt to be reasonable for the subject property. Following is the calculation of the fee simple market value of the subject property as of the date of the site visit, June 20, 2014.

\[
166,486 \text{ square feet} \times $10.00/\text{SF} \quad = \quad $1,664,860
\]

Rounded to: \quad $1,660,000

RECONCILIATION OF FINAL VALUE

The as is market value of the subject tract is based on the sales comparison approach that was applied to the land as if vacant. The final as is market value conclusion for the subject property is $1,660,000, which recognizes the highest and best use of the site, location, and configuration. The value conclusion was based on six sales that were detailed in this appraisal. The subject property is located at the southwest corner of Liberty Way and Cox Road in West Chester Township, just east of a proposed development known as Liberty Centre that has broken ground and will spur other development in this area. Each of the six sales was carefully selected from the market since they are sites that reflect similarity to the subject property’s highest and best use. Each sale was verified with someone directly involved in the transaction. The sales comparison approach is the best method to estimate the market value of the subject property, and the final market value conclusion is based solely on the sales comparison approach.

FINAL VALUE

In conclusion, all weight is placed on the sales comparison approach applied to the land as if vacant. The final market value of $1,660,000 is being adopted for the subject property, based on a usable net land area of 3.822 acres, or 166,486 square feet. The value indicated herein is based on terms and conditions outlined in the underlying assumptions and limiting conditions, along with any others stated in the report. The market value is as of June 20, 2014, and is for the fee simple interest of the subject property.

As Is Market Value of the Fee Simple Interest as of June 20, 2014: \quad One Million Six Hundred Sixty Thousand Dollars ($1,660,000)
MARKETING/EXPOSURE TIME

It has been requested through USPAP in a statement on Appraisal Standards No. 6 (SMT-6) and through Advisory Opinion (G-7) that reasonable exposure time and marketing time estimates be discussed in appraisal reports. The Appraisal Standards Board (ASB) defines exposure time or retrospective marketing period as follows:

The estimated length of time of the property interest being appraised would have been offered on the market prior to the hypothetical consummation of a sale at market value on the effective date of the appraisal; a retrospective estimate based upon an analysis of past events assuming a competitive and open market.²

The ASB defines reasonable marketing period, or perspective marketing period, as follows:

The reasonable marketing time is an estimate of the amount of time it might take to sell a property interest in real estate at the estimated market value level during the period immediately after the effective date of an appraisal. Marketing time differs from exposure time, which is always presumed to precede the effective date of an appraisal.

In estimating the exposure time, or the retrospective marketing period, it is recognized that this period is a function of price, time and use, and is not an isolated estimate of time alone. The marketing time estimate, or retrospective marketing period, also takes these same items into consideration. Both estimated time periods refer to the entire process of selling a piece of real estate which again would vary depending upon the type of real estate it is as well as the exposure price which is being asked.

For estimating a reasonable exposure time and a reasonable marketing time for the subject property various sources were considered which includes information collected while gathering information thorough the sales verification process from the comparable sales used, interviews of market participants, and firsthand knowledge of sales occurring that have been appraised by Beck Consulting and subsequently sold.

For estimating a reasonable exposure time the market information gathered during the appraisal process indicated that an exposure time of approximately six to twelve months would be necessary for a final consummation of sale of the subject. This takes into consideration that approximately one month to two months would be needed in order to notify all possible market participants that the subject property would be for sale after which there would be negotiations and a contract which would probably take another two to three months, and then due diligence would need to be performed by the buyer as well as financing lined up which could take anywhere from one month to three months depending upon the particular market and the financing being sought. This process and time frame is supported by several of the sales in the Sales Comparison Approach which sold within one year from the time it was exposed on the market. These are historic sales and support the retrospective exposure time being estimated. This does assume a reasonable asking price be presented of approximately 10% above the market value derived herein.

For estimating the prospective marketing time the same information which was considered for estimating the above exposed time was taken into consideration. Further, it is thought that the market conditions which exist

in the last six to twelve months in the Greater Cincinnati industrial and office markets will exist for the next twelve months; thus a twelve month or less prospective marketing time is considered to be appropriate. Again this takes into consideration historic information received from the several sales in the Sales Comparison Approach which sold within one year from being listed on the open market for sale. This does assume a reasonable asking price be presented of approximately 10% above the market value derived herein. *PricewaterhouseCooper Real Estate Investor Survey, 2nd Quarter 2014*, reflects current marketing time for National Development Land properties between nine and 240 months, with an average of 53 months.
PART V. ADDENDA

- Appraiser Qualifications
- Appraiser Disclosure Statements
APPRAISER QUALIFICATIONS

LANCE R. BROWN, MAI

EDUCATION:
Master of Business Administration, University of Cincinnati
December 1998; Major: Marketing and Real Estate

Bachelor of Science, University of Cincinnati
December 1992; Major: Real Estate

Adjunct Professor, Real Estate Appraisal—University of Cincinnati

Various courses and exams of professional appraisal organizations

PROFESSIONAL EXPERIENCE:
12/98 to Present—Executive Vice President, Beck Consulting, Inc.


12/94 to 5/95 – Staff appraiser for the Appraisal Company of America.

1/89 to 12/94 – Appraiser, American Research and Appraisal Center.

2/86 to 1/89 – Self-employed appraiser and research consultant, providing services to independent appraisal companies in Cincinnati.

SPECIALIZATIONS:
Prepare appraisals of all types of real property for mortgage purposes.

Complete detailed condemnation/eminent domain appraisals including partial acquisitions and severance damage, for ODOT, Army Corps, and local public authorities.

Provide appraisals for real property, tax cases, including testimony for ad valorem tax purposes for government and private clients.

Prepare appraisals for contested real property, including court testimony.

Provide appraisals and analysis of proposed commercial, industrial, and residential developments for mortgage lending.

List and facilitate the sale and lease of residential and commercial property.
LICENSES AND CERTIFICATIONS:


Kentucky State certified general appraiser: License No. 002243 issued March 26, 1999.

Indiana State certified general appraiser: License No. CG41100034 issued September 9, 2011

Ohio Department of Transportation Pre-qualified Appraiser Code Number 081114 issued December 4, 1995.

Ohio Department of Transportation Pre-qualified Appraisal Reviewer issued November 8, 2000.

Licensed real estate sales agent certificate number 332617 issued November 14, 1986.

BUSINESS & PROFESSIONAL AFFILIATIONS:

MAI designated member of the Appraisal Institute

GAA member of the Real Estate Appraisal Section of the National Association of Realtors

SR/WA Candidate Member of International Right of Way Association

Member of the National Association of Realtors

Member of the Greater Cincinnati Association of Realtors
TODD M. SCHMUTTE

EDUCATION: Bachelor’s of Business Administration, University of Cincinnati
June 2000; Major: Finance and Real Estate

Course RE-492, Real Estate Appraisal, University of
Cincinnati – 06/99

Course 772, National Uniform Standards of Professional
Appraisal Practice, Lincoln Graduate Center – 04/02

Course 120, Appraisal Procedures, The Appraisal Institute – 03/03

Course 310, Basic Income Capitalization, The Appraisal
Institute – 03/04

Course 510, Advanced Income Capitalization, The Appraisal
Institute – 07/04

Course 530, Advanced Sales Comparison and Cost Approaches,
The Appraisal Institute – 03/05

PROFESSIONAL EXPERIENCE: 02/02 to Present—Assistant Vice President, Beck Consulting, Inc.

6/98 to 02/02—Account Executive, Pension Corporation of America.

SPECIALIZATIONS: Prepare appraisals of all types of real property for mortgage purposes.

Assist in the preparation of appraisals for condemnation.

Prepare appraisals of commercial property for real estate tax appeal

LICENSES AND CERTIFICATIONS: Ohio State certified general appraiser: Certificate No. 2007005172

BUSINESS & PROFESSIONAL AFFILIATIONS: Member of Alpha Rho Epsilon Real Estate Fraternity at
University of Cincinnati
APPRAISER DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

In compliance with Ohio Revised Code Section 4763.12 (C)

1. Name of Appraiser
   Lance Brown

2. Class of Certification/Licensure:
   ☑ Certified General
   ☐ Licensed Residential
   ☐ Temporary
   ☐ General
   ☐ Licensed

   Certification/Licensure Number: 409301

3. Scope: This report
   ☑ is within the scope of my Certification or License.
   ☐ is not within the scope of my Certification or License.

4. Service Provided By:
   ☑ Disinterested & Unbiased Third Party
   ☐ Interested & Biased Third Party
   ☐ Interested Third Party on Contingent Fee Basis

5. Signature of person preparing and reporting the appraisal

This form must be included in conjunction with all appraisal assignments or specialized services performed by a state-certified or state licensed real estate appraiser.

State of Ohio
Department of Commerce
Division of Real Estate
Appraisal Section
Cleveland (216) 787-3100
# APPRAISER DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

In compliance with Ohio Revised Code Section 4763.12 (C)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1. Name of Appraiser</th>
<th>Todd M. Schmutte</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. Class of Certification/Licensure:</td>
<td>✅ Certified General</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Certification/Licensure Number:</td>
<td>2007005172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Scope: This report</td>
<td>✅ is within the scope of my Certification or License.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Service Provided By:</td>
<td>✅ Disinterested &amp; Unbiased Third Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Signature of person preparing and reporting the appraisal</td>
<td>[Signature]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This form must be included in conjunction with all appraisal assignments or specialized services performed by a state-certified or state licensed real estate appraiser.

State of Ohio  
Department of Commerce  
Division of Real Estate  
Appraisal Section  
Cleveland (216) 787-3100